

Comment 1 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Tim

Last Name: Clevenger

Email Address: tjclevenger@yahoo.com

Affiliation:

Subject: ARB/Railroad Agreement too narrow

Comment:

Hi.

I'm concerned about the exclusion of long-distance train locomotives from the emissions reduction plans. The BNSF and UP lines through Southern California see over 100 trains per day, and each of those consist of heavily-polluting and smoking locomotives, often running at full power, running through residential neighborhoods.

Please consider modifying this agreement so that these trains require a "clean escort" of agreement-covered low-polluting engines when entering and travelling through metropolitan areas. Since both railroads have consolidated their lines through the area, residents living along those lines are unfairly exposed to the excessive concentration of pollution caused by the reduction in running lines.

Also, please consider working with the SCRRA and Amtrak to get the Green Goat into their fleets. Since SCRRA (Metrolink) locomotives and Amtrak Surfliner locomotives stop and go far more often than railroad locomotives, they would benefit greatly from hybrid technology and pollution controls.

Regards,

Tim Clevenger
Crestline, CA

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-22 10:40:12

No Duplicates.

Comment 2 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Mahesh

Last Name: Talwar

Email Address: oceanair1@att.net

Affiliation: OceanAir Environmental, LLC

Subject: Rail Agreement

Comment:

1. It is common practice for the major railroads to lease the locomotives from third party leasing companies. There may be more than 200 leased locomotives that are operated by BN and UP in California that do not bear their name on the locomotives. It is not clear if they are covered by this agreement

2. All the efforts that are part of the agreement bring only 20% reduction in PM. Even this 20% reduction is not a real number as most of the locomotives have already been equipped with idle reduction technology, or were already committed to installing them prior to the agreement. This agreement therefore creates not much new effort other than a huge regulatory system of monitoring, paper work, training, more administrative work. A lot of money it seems like will be spent on government personnel monitoring this program

3. The program as outlined is too weak and delivers very little public benefit at great administrative cost to both private and government.

4. Why not adopt South Coast AQMD's MOU Statewide and force all locomotives to comply with Tier II with early banking and credits as incentives. This will give 50% PM benefits, 60% NOx benefits. There are already technological developments in place to provide Tier II retrofit kits

In light of the above, we urge the Board to reject the agreement on the basis that it provides very little public benefits at great administrative burden. It is also based on misguided science, i.e. smoke and particulates are equivalent. I can understand a lay man saying this, but I have trouble seeing this inference in a regulatory document. Let me simply say that smoke and particulate matter are not equivalent.

In closing, we simply state that this agreement is based on too lenient measures, provides very little public benefit, is too bureaucratic in nature, and most of it is based on what the railroads are doing anyway. CARB has not presented what it is going to cost in CARB staff time and expense to implement and monitor this program. We must have the whole financial picture.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-23 08:34:24

No Duplicates.

Comment 3 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Eric/Kay

Last Name: Nelson

Email Address: erickayn@comcast.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Protect Californians with tougher standards

Comment:

To the ARB

Please enact the most stringent standards possible for all forms of transportation in California, in addition to the new Railyard Improvement standards.

Older commercial trucks need updated standards similar to the reductions you are implementing for the Railyards/locomotives within California.

Ships entering California waters likewise should be made to adhere to standards that will protect our health.

The ARB has an important job to do for the future health of all Californians. We ask that the board put real teeth in each new program for emission reduction, allowing for strict enforcement. Those who would profit at the expense of our health should be made to comply with standards that will assure improvement of our air!

Sincerely,

Eric and Kay Nelson
Vacaville, CA

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-23 10:54:20

No Duplicates.

Comment 4 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Adriano

Last Name: Martinez

Email Address: amartinez@hotmail.com

Affiliation: Natural Resources Defense Council

Subject: Comments On Rail MOU Clarification Document

Comment:

Please find attached comments regarding Rail MOU Clarification Document. Please contact me if there is a problem with the transmission of this document.

Thanks,

Adriano Martinez

Natural Resources Defense Council

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/4-comments_re_clarification_of_mou.pdf

Original File Name: Comments re clarification of MOU.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-24 16:17:20

No Duplicates.

Comment 5 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Jack
Last Name: Stewart
Email Address: jstewart@cmta.net
Affiliation:

Subject: Comment in support of Railroad MOU
Comment:

From: Jack Stewart, President
California Manufacturers & Technology Association

Thank you for accepting this testimony into the record of this proceeding.

CMTA supports the Memorandum of Understanding entered into between ARB and the railroads with regard to locomotive emissions. As a result of a voluntary and collaborative process, the MOU achieves 20% reduction in locomotive PM emissions statewide. Because of federal preemption over control of these emissions, the reductions are larger and sooner than could have been required by any California regulatory or legislative body.

In addition, CMTA supports the process ARB adopted to develop this MOU. By using a cooperative approach, California has avoided implementation delays due to disagreements over the State's legal authority over the affected companies. As a result, in the first 6 months of MOU implementation, the railroads have already made significant investments to reduce locomotive idling and smoking and increase the use of low sulfur fuel in California. The MOU has also stimulated plans to invest in new, cleaner technology, represented by the announcement to purchase 70 new switch engines for use in LA over the next two years.

CMTA advocates for both economic growth and a healthy environment. These goals require that government and industry work together to find solutions to environmental challenges. The railroad MOU represents such a solution and I urge you to keep the MOU in effect.

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-25 11:56:01

No Duplicates.

Comment 6 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Rachel

Last Name: Lopez

Email Address: LRACHEL835@aol.com

Affiliation: H.O.M.E.- Help Our Mira Loma Environment

Subject: Regarding MOU 2005

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/6-ry2006-5.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-5.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-25 13:55:41

No Duplicates.

Comment 7 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Dr. William

Last Name: Burke

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: SCAQMD

Subject: Comment Letter #7 Attached

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/7-ry2006-7.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-7.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-25 14:16:41

No Duplicates.

Comment 8 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Angelo

Last Name: Logan

Email Address: angelologan@eastyardcej.org

Affiliation: The Modesto Avila Coalition

Subject: Upcoming MOU Arrangements/Concerns

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/8-ry2006-8.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-8.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-25 14:21:01

No Duplicates.

Comment 9 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: David

Last Name: Crow

Email Address: tom.jordan@valleyair.org

Affiliation: SJVAPCD

Subject: Railroad Agreement

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/9-ry2006-9.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-9.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-25 14:25:48

No Duplicates.

Comment 10 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Judy

Last Name: Chu

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Assemblymember, 49th District

Subject: Comment Letter #10 Attached

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/10-ry2006-10.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-10.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-25 14:27:55

No Duplicates.

Comment 11 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Jackie

Last Name: Goldberg

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Assemblymember, 45th District

Subject: Comment Letter #11 Attached

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/11-ry2006-11.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-11.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-25 14:37:04

No Duplicates.

Comment 12 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Gilbert

Last Name: Cedillo

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Senator, 22nd District

Subject: Rescind the Statewide Agreement with the Railroads

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/12-ry2006-12.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-12.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-26 14:43:49

No Duplicates.

Comment 13 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Candy

Last Name: Saenz

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: South Bay Latino Chamber of Commerce

Subject: CARB MOU with BNSF and UP

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/13-ry2006-13.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-13.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-26 14:46:22

No Duplicates.

Comment 14 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: David

Last Name: Spence

Email Address: ccca97@aol.com

Affiliation: California Contract Cities Assoc.

Subject: January 27, 2006 Public Hearing on MOU Between CARB & the Railroads
Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/14-ry2006-14.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-14.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-26 14:47:59

No Duplicates.

Comment 15 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: Lawrence

Last Name: Dale

Email Address: ldale@barstowca.org

Affiliation: Mayor, City of Barstow

Subject: Support the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU)

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/15-ry2006-15.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-15.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-26 14:52:28

No Duplicates.

Comment 16 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: James

Last Name: Provenzano

Email Address: jjpro@adelphia.net

Affiliation: Clean Air Now

Subject: Rescind ARB/Railroad Statewide Agreement

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/16-ry2006-16.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-16.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-26 15:07:00

No Duplicates.

Comment 17 for ry2006. (Non-Reg)

First Name: John

Last Name: Wohlmuth

Email Address: akerr@cvag.org

Affiliation: Coachella Valley Assoc. of Governments

Subject: Letter of Support to Rescind MOU with Railroads

Comment:

See attached document.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/17-ry2006-17.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-17.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-01-26 15:17:53

No Duplicates.

Comment 1 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Martha

Last Name: Escutia

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: California State Senator, 30th District

Subject: Comment #1 received day of Board mtg. attached.

Comment:

Comment #1 submitted day of board meeting.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/18-ry2006-ws-1.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-1.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-08 11:34:21

No Duplicates.

Comment 2 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Susan

Last Name: Derer

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: South Bay Cities Council of Governments

Subject: A Resolution of the SBCCG Concerning the Statewide Agreement with Railroads
Comment:

Comment #2 submitted day of board meeting.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/19-ry2006-ws-2.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-2.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-08 11:38:54

No Duplicates.

Comment 3 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Chung

Last Name: Liu

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: SCAQMD

Subject: Comment #3 received day of Board mtg. attached.

Comment:

Comment #3 submitted day of board meeting.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/20-ry2006-ws-3.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-3.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-08 11:43:40

No Duplicates.

Comment 4 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Aeron

Last Name: Arlin Genet

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: San Luis Obispo APCD

Subject: Proposed Clarification of the ARB/Railroad Statewide Agreement
Comment:

Comment #4 submitted day of board meeting.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/21-ry2006-ws-4.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-4.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-08 11:47:27

No Duplicates.

Comment 5 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: SCAQMD

Last Name: SCAQMD

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: SCAQMD

Subject: Foes of State Pollution Pact With 2 Railroads Urge Panel to Redo It
Comment:

Comment #5 submitted day of board meeting.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/22-ry2006-ws-5.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-5.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-08 11:53:20

No Duplicates.

Comment 6 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Cindy

Last Name: Montanez

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Assemblymember, 39th District

Subject: The MOU between CARB and the Railroad Industry in Southern California

Comment:

Comment #6 submitted day of board meeting.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/23-ry2006-ws-6.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-6.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-08 11:55:25

No Duplicates.

Comment 7 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Board item or it was a duplicate.

Comment 8 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Barbara

Last Name: Lee

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: CAPCOA

Subject: Comments on Staff's Clarification of the MOU between the ARB & the Participating Railroads

Comment:

Comment #9 submitted day of board meeting.

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/25-ry2006-ws-9.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-9.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-08 12:31:36

No Duplicates.

Comment 9 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Board item or it was a duplicate.

Comment 10 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Valdez, Stehly,

Last Name: Barr

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Railroad Panel

Subject: Comment for MOU

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/40-comment__7_submitted_at_board_mtg..zip

Original File Name: Comment #7 submitted at board mtg..zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 12:45:10

No Duplicates.

Comment 11 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Scott

Last Name: Carpenter

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: RailPower

Subject: Comment for MOU

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/41-ry2006-ws-8.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-8.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 12:53:48

No Duplicates.

Comment 12 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Sylvia

Last Name: Betancourt

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Modesto Avila Coalition

Subject: Comment for MOU

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/42-ry2006-ws-10.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-10.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 12:54:45

No Duplicates.

Comment 13 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Gloria

Last Name: Negrete McLeod

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Assemblymember, 61st District

Subject: Comment for MOU

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/43-ry2006-ws-11.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-11.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:01:10

No Duplicates.

Comment 14 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: John

Last Name: Sprague

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: City of Roseville

Subject: Statewide and Local Emission Reduction Efforts

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/44-ry2006-ws-12.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-12.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:03:52

No Duplicates.

Comment 15 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Fran

Last Name: Pavley

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Assemblymember, 41st District

Subject: Jan. 27, 2006 Mtg., Agenda Item # 06-1-6

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/45-ry2006-ws-13.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-13.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:04:55

No Duplicates.

Comment 16 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Amisha

Last Name: Patel

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: California Chamber of Commerce

Subject: Continuation of the ARB/Railroad Statewide Agreement Support
Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/46-ry2006-ws-14.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-14.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:06:36

No Duplicates.

Comment 17 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Christopher

Last Name: Weaver

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Engine, Fuel and Emissions

Subject: Comment for MOU

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/47-ry2006-ws-15.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-15.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:07:36

No Duplicates.

Comment 18 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Melissa

Last Name: Sherman

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Asthma & Allergy Foundation of America

Subject: The Air Resources Board/Railroad MOU

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/48-ry2006-ws-16.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-16.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:08:16

No Duplicates.

Comment 19 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Gerald

Last Name: Serventi

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Port of Oakland

Subject: Comment for MOU

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/49-ry2006-ws-17.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-17.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:09:05

No Duplicates.

Comment 20 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Fran

Last Name: Inman

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Majestic Realty Co.

Subject: Testimony of Fran Inman of Majestic Realty Co.

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/50-ry2006-ws-18.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-18.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:10:02

No Duplicates.

Comment 21 for ry2006. (At Board Hearing)

First Name: Martha

Last Name: Lenz

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: ElectroMotive

Subject: Comment for MOU

Comment:

Attachment: www.arb.ca.gov/lists/ry2006/51-ry2006-ws-19.pdf

Original File Name: ry2006-ws-19.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2006-02-14 13:10:50

No Duplicates.